Before the FEDERAL COMMUNICATIONS COMMISSION Washington, D.C. 20554

HE	The state of the s	IVED
JÙN	18	1998

In the Matter of)		JUN 18 1998
)		ELEMAN COMMUNICATIONS COMMISSION
Petition for Interim Waiver of)	CC Docket No. 80-286	SCHOOL OF THE SECRETARY
Section 36.2(a)(3) Filed by:)	DA 98-909	
The National Exchange Carrier)		
Association, Inc.)		

REPLY COMMENTS OF SBC COMMUNICATIONS, INC.

SBC Communications Inc. ("SBC") provides these Reply Comments in accordance with Public Notice DA 98-909, requesting comments and reply comments on the Petition for Interim Waiver filed by the National Exchange Carrier Association (NECA) seeking a waiver of Section 36.2(a)(3) of the Comission's rules. This rule requires that telephone companies determine "actual use" measurements based on "studies of traffic handled or work performed during a representative period for all traffic."

I. TRAFFIC ASSOCIATED WITH INTERNET USAGE IS INTERSTATE AND SHOULD BE TREATED AS SUCH FOR SEPARATIONS PURPOSES.

The vast majority of parties filing comments in response to the Commission's Public Notice support granting the Petition as filed. Even more important, however, is the fact that the majority of parties, including SBC, agree that Internet usage is interstate in nature and should be reflected that way in the separations process. Several of the

No. of Copies rec d____ List A B C D E

¹ 47 C.F.R. 36.2(a)(3).

² See NECA Petition at p. 1.

commenters provide additional confirmation of the fact that Internet usage is indeed interstate in nature.³

The HSA/Pottawatomie Group cites several instances in which federal prosecution has occurred concerning the use of Internet facilities to illegally provide pornographic materials across state lines.⁴ Certainly, since the FBI and the Department of Justice have already recognized that the Internet is subject to laws regarding interstate commerce, it would be flatly inconsistent for the Commission to state that it is not interstate. Also, the Park Region Telephone Company, who identifies itself as both a telephone company and an Internet service provider, provides specific evidence that "less than two percent of the inquiries to our Minnesota Web Site originate in Minnesota." This is additional clear evidence that the preponderance of Internet traffic is interstate in nature. ICORE, Kerrville, Park Region, and TELEC provide specific information regarding the interstate nature of Internet traffic and the impacts that it causes if misclassified as "local." This information provides additional support for the Commission to conclude that Internet use should be considered jurisdictionally interstate and that misclassification as "local," as shown in NECA's cost study guideline, should be

³ See Comments of Bell South, at p. 2; Comments of Small Western LEC's, at p. 2; Comments of Exchange Carriers of Utah, at p. 2; Comments of Fred Williamson, at p. 3; Comments of Harris, Skrivan & Associates (Pottawatomie Group), at p. 2; Comments of Home Telephone, at p. 3; Comments of ICORE at p. 2; Comments of John Staurulakis, at p. 5; Comments of Kerrville, at p. 2; Comments of Northeast Florida, at p. 2; Comments of Park Region, at p. 1; Comments of Plant Tel. Co., at p. 1; Comments of Rural Tel. Coalition, at p. 2; Comments of TDS, at p. 3; Comments of USTA, at pp. 2-3, Comments of VITA, at p. 2; Comments of WETA/WECA/OECA, at p. 2; Comments of Western Alliance, at p. 1.

⁴ See Comments of Harris, Skrivan & Associates (Pottawatomie Group), at p. 2.

⁵ See Comments of Park Region, at p. 1.

⁶ <u>See</u> Comments of ICORE at pp. 2-3; Comments of Kerrville, at p. 3; Comments of Park Region, at p. 1; and Comments of TELEC, at p. 2.

immediately corrected. SBC agrees with those companies who state that they believe the separations procedures do not preclude the classification of Internet traffic as interstate.⁷

The arguments raised by ALTS and MCI questioning the basis for NECA's

Petition are a mere smoke screen. ALTS's assertion that carriers cannot petition for

waiver is baseless.⁸ Regardless who requests the waiver, if it is still subject to review by

the regulatory body and, in this case, the comments of interested parties, due process is

served. ALTS' and MCI's argument regarding the jurisdiction of Internet traffic is

addressed by the simple observation of Northeast Florida when it states: "The fact that the

Commission decided the Internet service providers, operating under an information

service provider ('ISP') classification, require an exemption from interstate access

charges clearly demonstrates that the usage is interstate in nature. Otherwise, there would

be no interstate traffic originated or terminated for which an exemption would be

needed."9

II. POSSIBLE DIFFICULTY IN MEASURING INTERNET USAGE IS NO REASON TO CLASSIFY IT AS LOCAL.

There are two reasons often stated as to why certain parties do not classify

Internet as interstate, even though they may acknowledge that it is in fact interstate in
nature. First, several commenting parties have stated that the NECA cost study

⁷ <u>See</u> Comments of Harris, Skrivan & Associates (Pottawatomie Group), at p. 2; Comments of Home Telephone, at p. 7; and Comments of Western Alliance, at p. 1.

⁸ See Opposition of the Association for Local Telecommunications Services, at p. 8.

⁹ See Comments of Northeast Florida, at p. 2. See also NECA Petition, at pp. 2-4.

guidelines for pooling carriers require that Internet usage be treated as "local." SBC agrees with Fred Williamson & Associates, Inc. which notes correctly that this is merely an interpretation by NECA and is subject to a Commission ruling/order. 11

Second, and we suspect this is the real reason that some parties do not want

Internet classified as interstate, several commenters observe that it is difficult to measure
the traffic associated with Internet usage. SBC agrees with Home Telephone Company
that while it may be difficult to measure the amount of Internet traffic which is interstate,
it is an undisputed fact that the majority of Internet traffic crosses state lines. SBC
identified the procedures it uses to determine Internet usage in its Comments. SBC
concurs with Home Telephone Company in the assessment that the mere fact that there
may be difficulty in measuring such traffic is not a sufficient reason to classify all
Internet traffic as intrastate.

III. CONCLUSION

SBC agrees with those who urge the Commission to address the real problem and simply declare that Internet usage should be treated as jurisdictionally interstate.¹⁶ This

¹⁰ <u>See</u> Comments of WITA, WECA, OECA, at p. 3; Comments of John Staurulakis, at p. 3; Comments of Fred Williamson, at p. 3.

¹¹ See Comments of Fred Williamson, at p. 3.

¹² See Comments of Northeast, at p. 2; Comments of TDS, at p. 5; and Comments of Western Alliance, at p. 7).

¹³ See Comments of Home Telephone Company, at p. 6.

¹⁴ See Comments of SBC Communications Inc., at pp. 5-6.

¹⁵ See Comments of Home Telephone Company, at p. 6.

¹⁶ See Comments of FW&A, at p. 6; Comments of USTA, at p. 3; and Comments of WITA/WECA/OECA, at p. 3.

simple action would moot the need for any waivers as suggested by NECA and would resolve the dilemma once and for all. Any other action would be merely a stop-gap measure and would require additional action by the Commission and the parties, while keeping the entire industry in a state of uncertainty for no good reason.

Respectfully submitted

SBC COMMUNICATIONS INC.

Robert M Tynch

Durward D. Dupre

Michael J. Zpevak

Robert J. Gryzmala

Attorneys for

SBC Communications Inc.

One Bell Plaza, Room 3007

Dallas, Texas 75205

(214) 464-5550

June 18, 1998

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, Katie M. Turner, hereby certify that the foregoing, "REPLY COMMENTS OF SBC COMMUNICATIONS INC." in CC Docket No. 80-286 has been filed this 18th day of June, 1998 to the Parties of Record.

Katie M. Turner

June 18,1998

THE HONORABLE WILLIAM E KENNARD CHAIRMAN FEDERAL COMMUNICATIONS COMMISSION 1919 M STREET NW - RM 814 WASHINGTON DC 20554

THE HONORABLE MICHAEL K POWELL COMMISSIONER FEDERAL COMMUNICATIONS COMMISSION 1919 M STREET NW ROOM 844 WASHINGTON DC 20554

THE HONORABLE SUSAN NESS COMMISSIONER FEDERAL COMMUNICATIONS COMMISSION 1919 M STREET NW ROOM 832 WASHINGTON DC 20554 THE HONORABLE CHERYL L PARRINO CHAIR WISCONSIN PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION P O BOX 7854 MADISON WI 53707-7854

THE HONORABLE HAROLD W FURCHTGOTT-ROTH
COMMISSIONER
FEDERAL COMMUNICATIONS COMMISSION
1919 M STREET NW ROOM 802
WASHINGTON DC 20554

THE HONORABLE DAVID W ROLKA
COMMISSIONER
PENNSYLVANIA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION
NORTH OFFICE BUILDING - RM 110
COMMONWEALTH AVENUE AND NORTH ST
HARRISBURG PA 17105

THE HONORABLE GLORIA TRISTANI COMMISSIONER FEDERAL COMMUNICATIONS COMMISSION 1919 M STREET NW ROOM 826 WASHINGTON DC 20554

THE HONORABLE JOAN H SMITH COMMISSIONER OREGON PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION 550 CAPITOL ST NE SALEM OR 97310

THE HONORABLE THOMAS L WELCH CHAIRMAN MAINE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION 242 STATE STREET STATE HOUSE STATION 18 AUGUSTA ME 04333 DEBRA M KRIETE
PENNSYLVANIA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION
NORTH OFFICE BUILDING - ROOM 110
COMMONWEALTH AVENUE AND NORTH STREET
HARRISBURG PA 17105-3265

STEVE BURNETT
FEDERAL COMMUNICATIONS COMMISSION
COMMON CARRIER BUREAU - ACCOUNTING
& AUDITS DIVISION
2000 L STREET NW RM 257
WASHINGTON DC 20036

DEBBIE BYRD
FEDERAL COMMUNICATIONS COMMISSION
COMMON CARRIER BUREAU - ACCOUNTING
& AUDITS DIV.
2000 L STREET NW - RM 258K
WASHINGTON DC 20036

CONNIE CHAPMAN
FEDERAL COMMUNICATIONS COMMISSION
COMMON CARRIER BUREAU - ACCOUNTING &
AUDITS DIVISION
2000 L STREET NW - RM. 258H
WASHINGTON DC 20036

SANDY IBAUGH INDIANA UTILITY REGULATORY COMMISSION 302 W WASHINGTON SUITE E-306 INDIANAPOLIS IN 46204

JONATHON LAKRITZ
CALIFORNIA PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION
CALIFORNIA STATE BUILDING
505 VAN NESS AVENUE
SAN FRANCISCO CA 94102

SAMUEL LOUDENSLAGER ARKANSAS PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION 1000 CENTER ST LITTLE ROCK AR 72203

CHUCK NEEDY
FEDERAL COMMUNICATIONS COMMISSION
COMMON CARRIER BUREAU - ACCOUNTING
& AUDITS DIVISION
2000 L STREET NW RM 812
WASHINGTON DC 20036

PAUL PEDERSON MISSOURI PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION POST OFFICE BOX 360 JEFFERSON CITY MO 65102

SCOTT POTTER
PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO
180 E BROAD ST 3RD FL
COLUMBUS OH 43215

JAMES BRADFORD RAMSAY
ASSISTANT GENERAL COUNSEL
NATIONAL ASSOCIATION OF REGULATORY
UTILITY COMMISSIONERS
1102 ICC BUILDING
CONSTITUTION AVENUE & 12TH ST NW
P O BOX 684
WASHINGTON DC 20044-0684

JEFFREY J RICHTER
PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION OF
WISCONSIN
P O BOX 7854
MADISON WI 53707-7854

MIKE SHEARD MONTANA PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION 1701 PROSPECT AVE P O BOX 202601 HELENA MT 59620

KAYLENE SHANNON
FEDERAL COMMUNICATIONS COMMISSION
COMMON CARRIER BUREAU - ACCOUNTING &
AUDITS DIV
2000 L STREET NW - RM 200H
WASHINGTON DC 20036

JOEL B SHIFMAN MAINE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION STATE HOUSE STATION #18 AUGUSTA ME 04333

FRED SISTARENIK STATE JOINT BOARD STAFF CHAIR NEW YORK STATE DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC SERVICE COMMUNICATIONS DIVISION THREE EMPIRE STATE PLAZA ALBANY NY 12223-1350 CYNTHIA VAN LANDUYT OREGON PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION 550 CAPITOL ST NE SALEM OR 97310

LYNN VERMILLERA
FEDERAL COMMUNICATIONS COMMISSION
COMMON CARRIER BUREAU - ACCOUNTING
& AUDITS DIV.
2000 L STREET NW - RM 200E
WASHINGTON DC 20036

JOHN WOBBLETON
FEDERAL COMMUNICATIONS COMMISSION
COMMON CARRIER BUREAU - ACCOUNTING &
AUDITS DIV.
2000 L STREET NW - RM 257
WASHINGTON DC 20036

ITS INC 1231 20TH STREET GROUND FLOOR WASHINGTON, DC 20036 RICK GUZMAN ASSISTANT PUBLIC COUNSEL 1701 N CONGRESS AVE 9-180 P O BOX 12397 AUSTIN TX 78711-2397 MARTHA S HOGERTY NASUCA 1133 15TH ST NW STE 550 WASHINGTON DC 20005 RICHARD A ASKOFF NATIONAL EXCHANGE CARRIER ASSOCIATION INC 100 SOUTH JEFFERSON ROAD WHIPPANY NJ 07981

CHRIS BARRON TCA, INC 3617 BETTY DRIVE SUITE I COLORADO SPRINGS CO 80917

CAROLYN MORRIS
ASSISTANT DIRECTOR
FEDERAL BUREAU OF INVESTIGATION
NINTH STREET AND PENNSYLVANIA AVE NW
WASHINGTON DC 20535

JIM RUTHERFORD
GENERAL MANAGER
MCLOUD TELEPHONE COMPANY
13439 N BROADWAY EXTENSION
SUITE 200
OKLAHOMA CITY OK 73114

MARGOT SMILEY HUMPHREY KOTEEN & NAFTALIN LLP COUNSEL FOR NRTA 1150 CONNECTICUT AVE NW SUITE 1000 WASHINGTON DC 20036

DAVID COSSON NTCA 2626 PENNSYLVANIA AVE NW WASHINGTON DC 20037 LISA M ZAINA OPASTCO 21 DUPONT CIRCLE NW STE 700 WASHINGTON DC 20036

TERESA MARRERO SENIOR REGULATORY COUNSEL TELEPORT COMMUNICATIONS GROUP TWO TELEPORT DRIVE STATEN ISLAND NY 10311 LEON M KESTENBAUM JAY C KEITHLEY H RICHARD JUHNKE 1850 M STREET NW 11TH FLOOR WASHINGTON DC 20036 M ROBERT SUTHERLAND RICHARD M SBARATTA BELLSOUTH CORPORATION 1155 PEACHTREE STREET NE ATLANTA GEORGIA 30309-3610 ALAN BUZACOTT MCI TELECOMMUNICATIONS CORPORATION 1801 PENNSYLVANIA AVE NW WASHINGTON DC 20006

KENNETH T BURCHETT VICE PRESIDENT GVNW INC/MANAGEMENT 7125 S W HAMPTON PORTLAND OR 97223 JOHN STAURULAKIS PRESIDENT 6315 SEABROOK ROAD SEABROOK, MARYLAND 20706

MARK C ROSENBLUM PETER H JACOBY AT&T CORP 295 NORTH MAPLE AVENUE BASKING RIDGE NJ 07920 CECIL O SIMPSON JR OFFICE OF THE JUDGE ADVOCATE GENERAL U.S. ARMY LITIGATION CENTER 901 N STUART STREET STE 713 ARLINGTON VIRGINIA 22202-1837

MICHAEL J ETTNER GENERAL SERVICES ADMINISTRATION 1800 F STREET NW RM 4002 WASHINGTON DC 20405 NANCY RUE FROST & JACOBS LLP 2500 PNC CENTER 201 EAST FIFTH STREET CINCINNATI OH 45202

FRED WILLIAMSON & ASSOCIATES INC 2921 E 91ST ST SUITE 200 TULSA OK 74137 LAWRENCE W KATZ 1320 NORTH COURT HOUSE ROAD 8TH FLOOR ARLINGTON VIRGINIA 22201 ALAN N BAKER AMERITECH 2000 WEST AMERITECH CENTER DRIVE HOFFMAN ESTATES IL 60196 JAMES T HANNON U S WEST 1020 195TH ST NW STE 700 WASHINGTON DC 20036

EDWARD SHAKIN 1320 NORTH COURT HOUSE ROAD EIGHTH FLOOR ARLINGTON VA 22201 DAVID A IRWIN IRWIN CAMPBELL & TANNENWALD PC 1730 RHODE ISLAND AVE NW STE 200 WASHINGTON DC 20036-3101

LARRY SARJEANT LINDA KENT U S TELEPHONE ASSOCIATION 1401 H STREET NW SUITE 600 WASHINGTON DC 20005 LAURA H PHILLIPS DOW LOHNES & ALBERTSON 1200 NEW HAMPSHIRE AVE NW SUITE 800 WASHINGTON DC 20036

BENJAMIN H DICKENS JR GERARD J DUFFY BLOOSTON MORDKOFSKY JACKSON & DICKENS 2120 L STREET NW WASHINGTON DC 20037

MICHAEL T SKRIVAN HARRIS SKIRVAN & ASSOCIATES LLC 8801 SOUTH YALE STE 450 TULSA OK 74137

JAMES S BLASZAK KEVIN DILALLO LEVINE BLASZAK BLOCK & BOOTHBY LLP 2001 L STREET NW SUITE 900 WASHINGTON DC 20036

JEFFREY F BECK BECK & ACKERMAN FOUR EMBARCADERO CENTER SUITE 760 SAN FRANCISCO CA 94111 STATE OF ALASKA SAM COTTEN CHAIRMAN 1016 WEST SIXTH AVE SUITE 400 ANCHORAGE AK 99501-1963

PETER ARTH JR
EDWARD W ONEILL
PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA
AND THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION
STATE OF CALIFORNIA
505 VAN NESS AVE
SAN FRANCISCO CA 94102

CYNTHIA B MILLER STATE OF FLORIDA PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION CAPITAL CIRCLE OFFICE CENTER 2540 SHUMARD OAK BOULEVARD TALLAHASSEE FL 32399-0850 DIANE MUNNS
GENERAL COUNSEL
IOWA UTILITIES BOARD
LUCAS STATE OFFICE BUILDING
DES MOINES IA 50319

STEVEN T NOURSE ASSISTANT ATTORNEY GENERAL 180 E BROAD ST 7TH FLOOR COLUMBUS OH 43215-3793 PAT WOOD III CHAIRMAN PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION OF TEXAS 1701 N CONGRESS AVENUE P O BOX 13326 AUSTIN TX 78711-3326

PETER M BLUHM ESQ VERMONT PUBLIC SERVICE BOARD DRAWER 20 MONTPELIER VT 05620-2701

STEVE MCLELLAN
EXECUTIVE SECRETARY
WASHINGTON UTILITIES AND
TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION
OLYMPIA WASHINGTON

SHERYL TODD
ACCOUNTING POLICY DIVISION
COMMON CARRIER BUREAU
FEDERAL COMMUNICATIONS COMMISSION
2100 M STREET NW 8TH FLOOR
WASHINGTON DC 20554
(3 COPIES)